



Royal New Zealand Pipe Bands' Association

RNZPBA NON-MUSIC JUDGES GUIDE

This document has been compiled, written and edited by Jill Vincent, Christchurch, as Convenor of the Non-Music Judges' Selection Committee with direct input to its compilation from members of that Committee:

Eddie Eeles	Auckland	Drill
Rod Miller	Christchurch	Drill
John Agnew	Auckland	Dress
Neil McIntosh	Palmerston North	Mace Flourishing

Contents

(Note: topics are hyperlinked)

	Topic	Page
1.	Introduction	3
2.	Expectation	3
3.	What is expected of a judge – the result	3
4.	What is expected of a judge – the appraisal	4
5.	Satisfying expectations	4
6.	Aims of a Non-Music judge	5
7.	Procedures for judging a Street March	5
8.	Judging dress	7
9.	Judging Drum Majors	10
10.	Judging Displays	12
11.	Judging criteria	13
12.	The Principles of competent judging	13
13.	Conclusion	14

1. Introduction

It is the intention of the RNZPBA to have a system which enables the judging of Non-Musical events to be undertaken by people who are adequately versed in all aspects of Drill and Dress.

The content of this document covers the personal qualities likely to be found in successful judges:

- Expectation of Judges.
- Aims of a Non-Music Judge.
- Procedures for Judging a Street March.
- Guide to wearing Highland Dress to assist with Judging.
- Judging Drum Majors.
- Guidelines for Judging Displays.
- Principles of Competent Judging.

[Back to top](#)

2. Expectation

The expectation of Non-Music Judges does not differ from that of the Music Judges. In the Music Judges manual there are three sections on:

- 1) What is expected of a Judge - The result.
- 2) What is expected of a Judge - The Appraisal.
- 3) Satisfying expectations.

It is appropriate that these 3 sections be repeated in this document.

[Back to top](#)

3. What is expected of a judge – the result

In its very simplest terms, the adjudicator's primary responsibility in pipe band contests is to allocate points or placings, putting competing bands in order of merit to produce a result; decisive for the contest organiser and fair for the contestants.

In other words, sorting out winners, place-getters and also-rans.

But there is a wider dimension to the judging assignment. As well as just producing a result for the contest organizer, there are likely to be two questions implicit in the outcome:

- For competing bands 'Were we fairly placed and why?'
- For the adjudicator 'Was my adjudication fair and justifiable?'

In forming an understanding and appreciation of the judges' task it is therefore appropriate to recognize the first outcome, producing a result for the contest, may well be the easiest, but arriving at the outcome fairly, involves processes which should satisfy both the competing bands and, just as much, the Judge.

[Back to top](#)

4. What is expected of a judge – the appraisal

Arriving at a result is the most important role of the adjudicator but, second, and no less important, is to acknowledge that bands also deserve to know, in meaningful measure, how, why and where they excelled or failed.

However, it should also be acknowledged that there are bounds and limitations to what a judge can put into a critique, especially in the Street March when bands are timed at only 3 minutes apart. So, the critique in isolation may not totally justify a band's result but it must be given in the context of the comparative merits of a performance. A judging appraisal must be honest in conveying the negative aspects but in an appropriately constructive manner.

All of this sounds simple and logical. In reality, it calls for specialized skills and knowledge in all aspects of Judging drill and dress.

[Back to top](#)

5. Satisfying expectations

For the RNZPBA there will be a reasonable expectation that its judges will perform professionally in all aspects of the task and provide fair adjudication and enlightened appraisal to support their decisions. This expectation will be no less shared by competing bands. For judges, job satisfaction and self-respect lie in building a reputation for consistently delivering fair and balanced assessment. This can only be fully realised by being able to produce knowledgeable critiques on performances.

[Back to top](#)

6. Aims of a Non-Music judge

- To be encouraging and helpful to bands when writing reports.
- To give constructive criticism.
- To make positive comments.
- To be impartial.
- To maintain Honesty, Integrity and Sincerity.
- To write clearly so as bands are able to read reports.
- To be available to anyone who requires assistance.
- To enjoy what you are doing.
- To never stop learning.

[Back to top](#)

7. Procedures for judging a Street March

- **Judge No. 1.** Judges the start and up to the first wheel; judge the wheel and as the band moves away from the wheel.
- **Judge No. 2.** Judges covering and dressing, usually in a position between the two wheels.
- **Judge No. 3.** Judges the band approaching the second wheel, judge the wheel and as the band moves away from the wheel.

7.1 Method of Judging

Before the Street March commences inspect the area where you will be judging. Be familiar with any problems likely to upset the D/M or the band.

7.2 Right wheel

From approximately 25 metres from wheeling point, starting at the 4th file and moving across to the 1st file, check the covering of each file and the four intervals across the files. Check that the D/M is held in the centre. Stay beside the 1st file and, as the band passes you, check the dressing in all ranks and intervals between ranks, then move smartly past band to take up position on the inside of the wheel.

Check that each rank comes up square, goes right up to the common wheeling point and that the inner file of each rank closes up to one pace and is the same distance away from you that the front rank was. If greater, then the band has moved sideways to cover off (crabbing) and have not marched up square to the wheeling point. You cannot cover the person in front of you in a wheel. Has the Drum Major wandered off centre during the

wheel. Check each rank steps off together from the wheel. Is the band centre of the road. As band moves away from wheeling point, check the covering and interval of files and the Drum Major, from the rear – moving from 1st file to 4th file as you do this. Walk quickly back to be in position to prepare to judge the next band.

Interval - Check that the distance between files and ranks is consistently the same. Bands tend to march with 4 files of pipers, but 5-6 files of drummers. If this happens, interval is not regular. You would write on your sheet “side drummers’ interval not regular with rest of band”.

7.3 **Left wheel**

From position of 25 metres from wheeling point, starting with the 1st file and moving across to the 4th file, check the covering of each file and intervals across each file. Check that the D/M is held in the centre. Stay beside the 4th file and, as the band passes you, check the dressing in all ranks and the intervals between ranks, then move smartly past band to take up position on the inside of the wheel.

Check that each rank comes up square, goes right up to the wheeling point and that the inner file of each rank closes up to one pace and is the same distance away from you that the front rank was. If greater, then the band has moved sideways to cover off (crabbing) and have not marched up square to the wheeling point. You cannot cover the person in front of you in a wheel. Has the Drum Major moved off centre during wheel.

Check each rank steps off together from the wheel. Is band in the centre of the road. As the band moves away from wheeling point check the covering and interval of files and the Drum Major from the rear - moving from 4th file to 1st file as you do this. Walk quickly back to be in position to prepare to judge the next band.

7.4 **Covering and dressing**

Your judging area is approximately halfway between the two wheels, but closer to the first wheel. Check the distance you will cover to judge the covering and dressing of each band (usually 50 metres is about all you can cover comfortably).

At the end of your 50 metre stretch nearest to the first wheel, check across band from file 1 to file 4 that intervals are regular, that each file is covered, and the D/M is in the centre of the band. Stay beside the 4th file and, as the band marches past check each rank for dressing and interval. Once the band has passed, check across rear of the band again for covering and interval.

Walk quickly back to be in position to prepare to judge the next band.

[Back to top](#)

8. Judging dress

The dress inspection is held prior to the commencement of the Street March, also while the band is performing their Set. Prior to the Street March make sure the band remains at attention for the inspection. Be aware of time – remember bands move off at 3 minute intervals for the Street March, so be as quick as possible. You will have plenty of time to assess the bands again during their Set performances.

8.1 How to wear the kilt – a guide for the modern piper and drummer

This is a basic guide on how to wear a modern kilted outfit. It does not relate to full dress, as this is a little too complicated for this type of article. It does, however, relate to the type of outfit and uniform worn by modern pipe bands and soloists alike. It should be noted that some things, like wearing a dirk with day dress, a horsehair sporran with normal daywear, a feather bonnet unless in full number one dress, or a plaid without a jacket is generally considered quite ridiculous. A smart, well presented turn-out with good posture, creates a significant impression. It establishes credibility, and, for a performing musician, this is important.

Be proud to wear the kilt. In it you are constantly advertising our movement. Remember it is equally important that you respect the uniform after you have played your set etc. Don't debase it. We don't have an "undress" uniform.

8.2 Head Wear

The Glengarry is worn, centered on the head about 2 fingers width above the left eyebrow and tilted to the right, sitting about 1 finger width above the right eyebrow. If worn straight and too loose it may incline to the left, which is not desirable. It should be stored flat and the tails should be pressed.

The badge should be firmly affixed to the rosette and cleaned as appropriate.

The Bonnet or Balmoral is worn in a similar fashion with the right side turned down over the right ear. Sometimes they can also be turned down at the front depending on the manufacture of the hat.

The Badge is worn on the left side of the head. There is a bow or ribbons that are worn at the rear. The badge is generally affixed to the rosette on the left side of the hat. The hat should be moulded and the turned downside should not stand out like a "sore thumb". This can be achieved by first wetting the hat then moulding the shape before allowing it to dry. The shape will then be retained if the hat is well stored.

8.3 Necktie and Shirt

The Necktie should be well tied and smartly worn. A half or full Windsor knot always looks best. Plain or striped ties have largely replaced tartan ties. The length of the tie should only just cover the top of the belt buckle by 2-3mms and should not be so short as to allow any shirt to be seen over the kilt. An appropriate, full buttoned white shirt, or suitable colour to match the uniform or outfit, should be worn. The shirt should be clean and well pressed.

8.4 Jacket and Waistcoat

Obviously these should be clean and well pressed. There is little to be said about how to wear them, except that Kilt jackets and waistcoats are of a different length to a normal suit coat and therefore the latter should never be worn with a kilt.

The type of jacket worn can vary with the occasion. There are day wear, evening wear and formal jackets that fit the appropriate event. Most day jackets are of a shorter length to suit wearing with the kilt and may be left unbuttoned. If it is decided by the band to leave jackets unbuttoned, then all jackets must be undone.

If it is decided to button jackets, then all jackets must be buttoned. This depends on the style of seven jacket. It is a common tradition that the bottom button of a waistcoat is never done up.

8.5 Kilt, Sporrán and Belt

The kilt is worn high on the waist, just under the rib cage, and should be quite tight. It should not pucker when the waist belt is worn, which should also fit quite tightly.

The belt should be worn so that an even amount or no kilt at all is visible above the belt. Any leather belt stays should be firmly pressed against the buckle. If appropriate, leather belts should be polished as required.

The bottom of the kilt should cut across the top of the knee cap. It should be some 6cms above the floor when the wearer is kneeling in an upright position. This is best judged by the Drum Major or member responsible for checking the bands uniformity NOT THE WEARER. It should not be worn too low (which seems to be increasingly common) and it must NOT droop at the rear as it does on far too many wearers. It should be clean and well pressed. Always air and hang the kilt after wearing and don't forget the moth balls!

The best kilts are usually made of worsted wool, with the heavier weighted kilts sitting better on the wearer. They can be pleated at the back to match the pattern of the tartan or pleated to stripe in the military fashion.

The sporran, belt buckle and centre line of the kilt should all line up. This should also include the shirt buttons and tie.

The shirt should be pulled down from under the kilt so that it does not pucker and bellow around the waist.

Dress Sporrans should sit over the groin and therefore there should be a reasonable space between the belt buckle and the sporran. Ensure the straps are properly affixed and not twisted, with loose end held by a belt stay. A little boot polish should be applied to the waist belt and sporran strap and can be buffed off with a stocking to prevent any polish getting onto the kilt. Hair Sporrans, if worn, should have both lower edges level with the bottom of the kilt, with the centreline bowed slightly below it.

8.6 Kilt Pin

The kilt pin is worn on the right side of the kilt, secured on the open flap of the apron. It does NOT secure the flap to the rest of the kilt.

It is worn for its aesthetic appearance only. It is best worn about halfway up the kilt, or further down the apron, but not right at the foot of it. Usually it is affixed to follow the striped pattern of the kilt. In a band situation they should all be uniformly placed.

8.7 Hose and Flashes

There is usually a centre line with hose. This obviously should run up the centre of the shin bone. The top of each hose should be turned down the same height and the top edge should sit 4 fingers below the kneecap and level all around the leg.

They are worn lower than most newcomers expect, as they are more used to seeing walk socks, which are commonly worn higher than the kilt hose. A common error is hose pulled up far too high at the rear often almost touching kilts which are themselves too long all around or drooping badly at the rear. Both hose should be levelled so that they are each at the same height in comparison to the other.

The Sgian Dubh is worn in the right hose, pushed into the sock so as to show the top half of the handle.

Garters should be firm and support the hose and the flashes should each protrude the same distance below the turnover of the hose. Flashes should be centered on each hose and, again, the front edge should line up with the shin bone or sit exactly on the side of the leg.

8.8 Brogues

Standard Brogues or Gillie Brogues are both appropriate for day wear. Quite often buckled shoes are worn with evening wear. They should be cleaned with boot polish, ensuring to clean the welts around the tip of the sole and ensure the toe edge of the sole is blackened. This often scuffs when walking and is overlooked by many when cleaning the shoes.

Laces on the Gillie Brogues should cross at the front a number of times, cross at the rear and then be wrapped around a hand's breadth above the ankle (not too far up the leg like a Viking) and knotted or a bow tied in the lace. The knot can be set at the front or side of the leg.

General preference seems to dictate that if the flashes are worn on the side, the laces are tied on the side. Do not wear long Gillie style laces with normal brogues or shoes. There is nothing worse than someone trying to obtain uniformity with the rest of a band like this. It looks comical. It is obvious that the shoes are different and adding Gillie laces does nothing to hide that fact.

8.9 Overall package

Once you have dressed yourself, check the overall impression in a full length mirror, or, if you have dressed yourself from the back of your car, have your Drum Major, Custodian etc check you over. Ensure that everything including hat, tie, kilt pattern, waist belt and sporran are all centred. Ensure that the kilt does not hang too low or droop at the rear and that the sporran is not hanging too high or low. Check that the hose are even and level all around and are not too high. Check that the flashes are correctly positioned.

[Back to top](#)

9. Judging Drum Majors

If possible, position yourself where you can observe the start but can also see the first wheel. The Drum Major is the figurehead of a band and should lead by example. As soon as a Drum Major steps in front of his/her band he/she is "on parade".

9.1 Self-Discipline at Point 'A'

- Take note how the Drum Major acts at point 'A'. Does he/she lead the band up to the marks and bobble around trying to position himself/herself.
- Is the about turn to face the band steady or wobbly.
- Listen to the command to 'stand at ease' 'stand easy'.

- Does the Drum Major 'stand at ease' 'stand easy' BEFORE moving through the band for a chat or talking to officials.
- Does the Drum Major check the height of his/her hose at point 'A' – not a good look. Listen to the commands to bring the band back up to attention.
- Does the Drum Major give the commands from position of 'attention'.
- Watch the about turn to face the front – is it steady or wobbly.
- Check that the Mace is straight, with the tip of the Mace beside and slightly in advance of the right big toe, in position of 'attention.' The Mace should be held with a firm grip, thumb pointing upwards, elbow bent so as the forearm is parallel with the ground, heels together, feet apart at an angle of 45degrees. The Mace is only held on a slant at the 'easy' position.
- Listen to the command to "Quick March".
- Is the step off snappy.
- Is the Mace transferred to the left hand, for the 'carry position,' in a military movement, or is it rushed. The transfer should all be done on the left foot. Check that the right arm goes down to the side on the left foot after the transfer, then swings forward on the next left foot and does not go to the forward arm swing from the Mace.
- The hand must be closed on the free arm when executing movements with the Mace.

9.2 Department

- Head should be still and not turning. It is permissible to turn the head, in a military movement, when executing the wheel and then turning it back to the front, smartly, at the completion of the wheel.
- Are shoulders steady and square to the front.
- Is the Drum Major straight and not leaning forward from the waist.
- Does he/she bounce when marching.
- Eyes should be up and looking straight ahead.
- Is arm swing straight, front to rear.
- Is arm swing too high in front with no back swing.
- Look for a nice relaxed bearing.

9.3 Wheels

- Watch Mace Drill in wheels.
- During the wheel watch the foot work. Feet should not kick forward and the heels should not kick up at the back. Knees should be forward, and toe dropped.
- Is Mace parallel with the ground.
- Does the Drum Major wander during the wheel.
- Is the band centre of the road at the completion of the wheel.
- If a Drum Major chooses to 'Swagger' the Mace, it should be in cadence with the music. The left arm should be fully extended at the bottom of the 'Swagger' then

curl up to the shoulder at the top of the 'Swagger.' The arm should not be pumped backwards and forwards.

- If a Drum Major chooses to 'Walk' the Mace, the arm and foot movements must be in unison with the Mace.
- Watch the shoulders are steady and keep a close eye on the arm swing.
- Make sure the arm is swinging straight, front to rear, and the wrist is locked. It is a fault of most Drum Majors to bend the arm, swing it out to the side and hook the wrist.
- Mace at the carry should be held diagonally across the body, forearm parallel with the ground, elbow close to body. Elbow and wrist should be in line with waist belt.

9.4 Dress

Should be IMMACULATE – nothing else is acceptable. The Drum Major must be in control and portray confidence with good bearing at all times. First impressions are usually a good guide to overall performance but BE AWARE OF MISTAKING SHOWMANSHIP FOR ABILITY.

[Back to top](#)

10. Judging Displays

10.1 Purpose

To assess the proficiency and the execution of the movements and evolutions a band performs during its Display.

10.2 Application

- 10.2.1 **Drum Major:** That he or she is in control of the band at all times and directs each movement accordingly.
- 10.2.2 **Appearance:** That all members are looking straight ahead, are in step, and all are working together as required.
- 10.2.3 **Covering:** That all files are covered off from front to rear when in such formation as requires it.
- 10.2.4 **Dressing:** That all ranks maintain dressing at all times
- 10.2.5 **Execution:** That all movements and evolutions are performed by all concerned as and when required, in as a proficient standard as possible. Take note of foot lift in mark time to ensure foot heights even.
- 10.2.6 **Variety:** That a reasonable number of movements or evolutions are performed in the time available.

10.3 Judging criteria

- 10.3.1 **Position:** Endeavour to be elevated and judge all bands from the same position.
- 10.3.2 **Observation:** Be alert and aware that there are no set rules and patterns to the various movements, but there are logical considerations that you can judge on viz – Dressing, Covering, out of step, mark time, slow marching, togetherness, do the movements flow nicely from one to the next, does the band make good use of the ground.
- 10.3.3 **Comments:** Make them factual, understandable and relevant. Make constructive comments that will help a band improve their performance. Give encouragement.
- 10.3.4 **Comparison:** Recognise that a particular band may perform very few actual movements and remain in band formation a lot, whilst another band may execute lots of movements and perform a good display. Ensure that the score is comparative to all others in every respect.

[Back to top](#)

11. Judging criteria

- 11.1 **Position:** Endeavour to be elevated and judge all bands from the same position.
- 11.2 **Observation:** Be alert and aware that there are no set rules and patterns to the various movements, but there are logical considerations that you can judge on viz – Dressing, Covering, out of step, mark time, slow marching, togetherness, do the movements flow nicely from one to the next, does the band make good use of the ground.
- 11.3 **Comments:** Make them factual, understandable and relevant. Make constructive comments that will help a band improve their performance. Give encouragement.
- 11.4 **Comparison:** Recognise that a particular band may perform very few actual movements and remain in band formation a lot, whilst another band may execute lots of movements and perform a good display. Ensure that the score is comparative to all others in every respect.

[Back to top](#)

12. The Principles of competent judging

- 12.1 **Honesty, Sincerity, Integrity:** You must be honest in your decisions, sincere in your comments and impartial, in order that your integrity is never questioned.
- 12.2 **Experience:** Your knowledge of drill and your ability to assess a band with regard to criticising them fairly. Such knowledge must be constantly reviewed and practiced. It is imperative that you check the area you are judging to determine any pitfalls.

- 12.3 **Consistency:** You must work out a format and judge every band from the same position.
- 12.4 **Communication:** You must be able to assess a band's performance and to comment on their faults in a way that will assist them in improving their efforts. In the Street March you have only 3 minutes to do this. The judge's sheet is the only consistent means of communication between the judge and a competing band. So, first and foremost the written comments should be legible otherwise there is no communication.
- 12.5 **Points/Ranking:** Must be relevant to the faults made, your comments on the score sheet, and in comparison to all other bands you have judged.
- 12.6 **Prejudging:** You must judge on what you see in front of you, not what a band did when you last saw them or how good you think they are.

13. Conclusion

Judges must set an example by being correctly dressed when judging. They must also conduct themselves in a proper manner at all times and must recognise and honour their responsibilities and display qualities of leadership, influence and trust in the context of the image and reputation of the organisation they represent.

[Back to top](#)